

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

<b>THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,</b>  <b>Plaintiff,</b>  <b>v.</b>  <b>THE DORCHESTER OWNERS ASSOCIATION,</b>  <b>Defendant,</b>	<b>CIVIL ACTION</b>  <b>NO. 20-1396</b>
--	---

**FINAL JUDGMENT, INJUNCTION, AND ORDER**

**AND NOW**, this 25<sup>th</sup> day of January 2023, following a bench trial on damages and oral argument on a number of issues, and upon consideration of Plaintiff’s Motion for Permanent Injunction, a Civil Penalty, and a Jury Trial for Damages (ECF 228) and Defendant’s Motion for JNOV (ECF 229) and related briefs (ECF Nos. 235, 236, 237, 238), it is hereby **ORDERED**:

1. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 3613(d)(1)(B), judgment is **ENTERED** against the Dorchester Owners Association and in favor of the United States in the amount of \$37,431.00, to be distributed to Bernard Halpern and Cynthia Halpern;
2. Plaintiff’s Motion for Permanent Injunction, a Civil Penalty, and a Jury Trial for Damages is **GRANTED in part and DENIED in part**, as follows:
  - a. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 3614(d)(1)(A), The Dorchester Owners Association is required to maintain its current policy entitled “Reasonable Accommodation Policy for an Emotional Support or Service Animal,” dated on July 5, 2022 and add one sentence: “The DOA shall promptly review and act on every application that has been submitted in accordance with the existing policy.”

- b. The DOA shall maintain its records of all ESA applications and its decisions on each for a period of three (3) years;
  - c. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 3614(d)(1)(C), judgment is **ENTERED** against the Dorchester Owners Association and in favor of the United States for a civil penalty in the amount of \$1.00; and
  - d. Plaintiff's request for punitive damages is **DENIED**;
3. Defendant's Motion for JNOV is **GRANTED in part and DENIED in part**, as follows:
- a. Defendant's motion for judgment notwithstanding the verdict as to the "Pattern or Practice" claim is **GRANTED**;
  - b. Defendant's motion for judgment notwithstanding the verdict is **DENIED** on all other claims;
  - c. Defendant's motion for a new trial is **DENIED**;
4. The Rule 11 inquiry is **DISMISSED** and no sanctions will be imposed; and
5. The Motion for Clarification (ECF 275) is **DENIED** as moot.

The Clerk shall close this case.

**BY THE COURT:**

**/s/ MICHAEL M. BAYLSON**

---

**MICHAEL M. BAYLSON, U.S.D.J.**